

Allerdale Borough Council

Listed Building Consent Application LBC/2022/0043

Development Panel Report

Reference Number: LBC/2022/0043
Valid Date: 15/09/2022
Location: The Went, All Saints Church, Kirkgate, Cockermouth,
CA13 9PJ
Applicant: Mr Hoddinott
Proposal: Removal of damaged Victorian pavers to central
section of The Went and replacement with granite
setts.

RECOMMENDATION

That listed building consent is not granted.

1. Summary

<u>Issue</u>	<u>Conclusion</u>
Heritage	The complete loss of the Victorian diamond pavers would adversely impact the historic fabric, character and setting of the grade II* listed All Saints Church. It is considered that the proposal will have a negative impact on the heritage asset contrary to Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1). We, therefore, recommend that the application is refused.

2. Proposal

2.1. The proposal involves the removal of the damaged Victorian pavers on the central section of The Went and replacement with granite setts.

2.2. The Plans for consideration are:

Location Plan
Block Plan
Drawing No 30 - External Works
Design and Heritage Statement

3. Site

- 3.1. The application site comprises the central section of The Went. The Went is a public right of way that connects Market Street to Kirkgate, running through the grounds of All Saints Church. The north-western end of The Went is often used by vehicles to access the church.
- 3.2. The Went is constructed of tarmac to the outside sections which is bound by stone copings and railings for the church yard. The central section is constructed of Victorian diamond pavers and stone flags. There are two types of the Victorian pavers which have subtle differences in appearance. Some of the pavers do not have as deep of a diamond cut and it is assumed that these pavers are a more recent replacement.
- 3.3. All Saints Church is a grade II* listed building, and the application site is located within the Cockermouth Conservation Area. The setting of the church comprises the church rooms, surrounding graveyard, trees and access within the Conservation Area.

4. Relevant Planning History

- 4.1. Application Reference FUL/2019/0240 - Formation of car parking including disabled parking spaces and associated works (as amended).

5. Representations

Town Council

- 5.1. Cockermouth Town Council have submitted an objection to the application advising that they would prefer to see the existing pavers re-set.

Historic England

- 5.2. Historic England provides advice when engagement can add most value. In this case they have not provided any advice. This should not be interpreted as comment on the merits of the application.

6. Environmental Impact Assessment

- 6.1. With regards to the Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) Regulations 2017, the development does not fall within Schedule 1 nor 2 and, as such, is not EIA development.

7. Duties

- 7.1. Section 66(1) of the Listed Buildings Act 1990 states that, in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

- 7.2. Section 72(1) of the Listed Buildings Act 1990 states that, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

8. Development Plan Policies

8.1. Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1)

Policy S1 Presumption in Favour of Development

Policy S2 Sustainable Development

Policy S3 Spatial Strategy and Growth

Policy S4 Design Principles

Policy S22 Transport Principles

Policy S27 Heritage Assets

Policy S33 Landscape

9. Other Material Considerations

- 9.1. National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2021).

10. Policy Weighting

- 10.1. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. This means that the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1) 2014 and the Allerdale Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2020 policies have primacy.

11. Assessment

- 11.1. The main assessment for the determination of the application is the impact on the historic fabric of The Went and the setting of All Saints Church. The interrelated assessment of the impact on the character and appearance of the Cockermouth Conservation Area is also important.
- 11.2. In order to assess the impact, Officers have considered the details of the heritage asset including its characteristics and significance. The Historic England listing description and reasons for listing are as follows:

803/1/43 KIRKGATE 28-AUG-51 (West side) CHURCH OF ALL SAINTS

GV II DATES OF MAIN PHASES, NAME OF ARCHITECT: Parish church of 1852-54 by J. Clarke.*

Materials: Coursed rubble stone with freestone dressings, graded-slate roof.

Plan: Cruciform plan with nave aisles and north and south porches, central tower and spire, south chapel and north vestry in transept aisles.

Exterior: Tall and compact Decorated style church. The west front has panelled buttresses, 4-light nave window and 3-light aisle windows. Nave clerestory windows are cusped circles, and the aisles have 2-light windows. Porches have steep gables and are flanked by pointed trefoil windows. Transepts have 4-light north and south windows, and their aisle windows are 3-light to south and north, and 2-light to east. They also have north and south doorways to vestry and chapel respectively and the vestry has a stack with paired octagonal shafts. The tower rises 2 stages above the nave, with clasping buttresses rising to gabled caps and corner pinnacles to the plain parapet. The tower has 2-light belfry openings with louvres. A tall stone spire has quatrefoil lights, and clock faces in the main directions. The chancel has a 5-light east window, and 2-light north and south windows.

Interior: The interior is elegantly proportioned. Nave arcades have round piers and leaf-band capitals to double-chamfered arches. Triple-chamfered crossing arches die into the imposts and the crossing is rib-vaulted with apex circle for bell ropes. The nave has an arched-brace roof on corbelled brackets, with scissor braces above the collar beam and tracery in the spandrels. In the aisles, the roofs are braced from the outer faces of the spandrels and the spandrels have pierced tracery as in the nave: this is both dramatic and unusual. Transepts have 2-bay east arcades similar to the nave but with leaf-band capitals of different design. Transepts also have arched-brace roofs boarded above the collar beams and the chancel has an open wagon roof. The chancel is enriched with blind arcading in north and south walls, and sedilia are under a crocketed arch with pinnacles. East and west windows have shafted rere arches. Walls are plastered. The sanctuary floor has diaperwork stone tiles, and there are raised floorboards below seating.

Principal Fixtures: The font is in bold Early-English style (1853), with detached marble shafts and leaf-band decoration around the bowl. It was probably designed by Clarke, as was the polygonal stone pulpit, which has blind trefoils. Benches have square panelled ends with buttresses and are later, as are the choir stalls with simple poppy heads and arcaded frontal. The east window by Hardman of Birmingham (1853) is a memorial to William Wordsworth (1770-1850) and was funded by public subscription. The west window is by C.E. Kempe (1891). Other late-C19 stained-glass windows of definite quality are attributed to Cox, Sons & Buckley and Ward & Hughes, and early C20 glass is attributed to Heaton, Butler & Bayne.

Subsidiary Features: Stone churchyard wall, iron railings, and east entrance with rusticated piers and iron gates, possibly C18 (LBS no 71696).

History: Parish church of 1852-54, replacing an earlier church destroyed by fire. William and Dorothy Wordsworth were baptised in the previous church, and their father is buried in the churchyard. The new church is by Joseph Clarke (1819 or 1820-1888), a London-based architect whose practice was very largely concerned with church-building and restoration. His known works date from the

middle of the 1840s until the time of his death. He was diocesan surveyor to Canterbury and Rochester and, from 1877, the newly-created diocese of St Albans. These posts helped bring in numerous commissions in these three dioceses but he also gained jobs over a much wider geographical area and examples of his work can be found in most parts of England. He was consultant architect to the Charity Commissioners. The church was extensively restored in 1959.

Sources: All Saints, Cockermouth: A Wordsworth church, n.d. N. Pevsner, The Buildings of England: Cumberland and Westmorland, 1967, pp 106-7. D. Thomson, The Stained Glass Windows of All Saints' Church, Cockermouth, n.d.

Reasons for designation: The church of All Saints, Kirkgate, is designated at Grade II for the following principal reasons:*

** It is an ambitious and accomplished church for the 1850s, its fine tall spire giving the building a commanding presence in the town.*

** It has fittings original to the church, including font and pulpit, Hardman east window installed in 1853 by public subscription to commemorate William Wordsworth in his hometown, and has late C19 stained glass of definite quality.*

** Clarke's careful and inventive design (as expressed in the unusual roof arcading, and the impressive proportions of the interior) demonstrates a high order of achievement.*

** The Wordsworth connection is of historical note.*

- 11.3. The history, architectural quality and physical and functional setting of contribute to the heritage significance of All Saints Church. The churchyard sits in a raised and prominent position to the surrounding townscape and is bisected by The Went which Historic England have previously described as a characterful, tree lined narrow access lane.
- 11.4. Officers consider that the complete loss of the pavers would adversely impact the historic fabric and character of The Went. There is not a significant number of damaged pavers with less than 30% requiring replacement. The damage to the pavers appears to have been caused by the set eroding away underneath. This has resulted in the pavers not having sufficient support and when a vehicle, or something heavy, travels over the paver, they become at risk of damage. As such, we consider this to be a maintenance issue rather than the Victorian pavers not being suitable.
- 11.5. With regards to the setting of the church, the narrow surrounding streets with frontage buildings means that the church is unseen until you are relatively close. This does heighten the importance of the immediate setting but also means that the impact from changes to the setting are much more localised.
- 11.6. Despite the localised impact, Officers consider that the Victorian pavers provide an important contribution to the character and historic fabric of All Saints Church,

its setting and period construction. Clay pavers with the impressed diamond pattern are a special feature to Cockermouth and only appear in a handful of locations within the Conservation Area (Cocker Lane, Mackreth Row, Wyndham Row, Waterloo St and Croft Terrace). The limited use of pavers throughout the town, and the Borough, heightens the importance of those along The Went. We, therefore, feel that the pavers should be repaired, or replaced like for like, and retained.

- 11.7. The proposed granite setts will not have the same positive contribution to the character and setting of the churchyard. It is considered that the proposal will have a negative impact on the heritage asset contrary to Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1). We, therefore, recommend that the application is refused.

12. Conclusions

- 12.1. The application site comprises the central section of The Went which is a public right of way that connects Market Street to Kirkgate, running through the grounds of All Saints Church. The proposal involves the removal of the damaged Victorian pavers on the central section of The Went and replacement with granite setts.
- 12.2. There is not a significant number of damaged pavers with less than 30% requiring replacement. The damage to the pavers appears to have been caused by the set eroding away underneath. As such, officers consider this to be a maintenance issue rather than the Victorian pavers not being suitable.
- 12.3. Officers consider that the Victorian pavers provide an important contribution to the character and historic fabric of The Went and All Saints Church. Clay pavers with the impressed diamond pattern are a special feature to Cockermouth and only appear in a handful of locations within the Conservation Area. We, therefore, feel that the pavers should be repaired, or replaced like for like, and retained.
- 12.4. The complete loss of the Victorian diamond pavers would adversely impact the historic fabric, character and setting of the grade II* listed All Saints Church. It is considered that the proposal will have a negative impact on the heritage asset contrary to Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1). We, therefore, recommend that the application is refused.

13. RECOMMENDATION

Not Grant

Reason: The complete loss of the Victorian diamond pavers would adversely impact the historic fabric, character and setting of the grade II* listed All Saints Church. It is considered that the proposal will have a negative impact on the heritage asset contrary to Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1).

