

**Allerdale Borough Council**

**Planning Application  
Development Panel Report**

**Reference Number:** LBC/2022/0029

**Valid Date:** 29/06/2022

**Location:** Pear Tree House, Blennerhasset, CA7 3RE

**Applicant:** Mr Chris Spencer

**Proposal:** Listed building consent for replacement of windows, repairs to the east chimney and repairs to painting to external wall to all elevations of property

**RECOMMENDATION**

**GRANT**

**1. Summary**

<b><u>Issue</u></b>	<b><u>Conclusion</u></b>
Heritage	The building is a Grade II listed property within the Conservation Area. The proposed works are to replace the properties existing range of external window fenestration and undertake repair works to the properties chimney plus paint its exterior. The window works mainly affect modern elements of the building and combined with the repair works /repainting are considered to represent an appropriate repair with minimal impacts.

**2. Introduction**

2.1 This matter is being brought before members as the applicant is an employee of the Council.

### **3. Proposal**

3.1 The proposal is for external alterations to the exterior of the building. The works include:

- Replacement windows to the property;
- Repair of eastern chimney stack;
- Re-render exterior of the building;
- Repainting the exterior of the property.

3.3 The Plans for consideration are:

Location Plan

Dwg 032 PR WIN

Dwg 032 PRWIN

Dwg 032 PRDIN-DET

Dwg 02 rev 01 GF floor plan

Applicant's amended email and plans dated 18th August 2022 revising the proposed double glazed sliding sash multipane windows to the gable with alternative replacement single glazed timber sliding sash windows and details of the rear elevation sliding sash windows.

### **4. Site**

4.1 Pear Tree House is Grade II listed with Winder Cottages; Pear Tree House is probably one of the oldest remaining properties within Blennerhasset (Bremner 2006). The property is of rubble stone construction with large projecting plinth stone foundations. The property shares several significant architectural features with Winder Cottages including similar distinctive inscribed lintels – 'I. N. 1686 God Fears' in the case of Pear Tree House and 'W. & M.B. 1678 Feare God' at No 3, Winder Cottages. The properties also share similar chamfered window surrounds with drip moulds above.

4.2 Pear tree House has been extended to the rear with a 2nd storey flat roofed addition constructed on top of ground floor rubble stone walls. The interior layout of the property has been significantly altered when the rear extension was added but original features remain including rough-hewn structural beams, chamfered stone door surrounds and the original layout can still be read.

4.3 The site is located within a designated Conservation Area.

### **5. Relevant Planning History**

5.1 There have been several applications relating to the site:

2/2006/0834 Full planning permission for the demolition of existing garage, construction of a single storey side extension, and replacement of 4no. Windows to front of dwelling, as amended by letter and plan received 23 August 2006.

2/2006/0835 Listed building consent for demolition of existing garage, construction of a single storey side extension, and replacement of 4no. Windows to front of dwelling, as amended by letter and plan received 23 August 2006.

LBC/2021/0028 Listed building consent for the installation of an electrical vehicle charging point to the boundary of the wall.

LBC/2022/0012 Listed building consent approved for replacement of a roof covering and rooflights on modern flat roof extension to the rear of the building (former window details submitted with this application were withdrawn)

## **6. Representations**

### **Parish Council**

- 6.1 The parish council has considered the application and feel that as a building is in a listed building and a Conservation area the proposed replacement windows and any replacement windows should be like for like.

### **Historic England**

The proposal does not fall within their consultation criteria.

### **Other representations**

- 6.2 The application was advertised on site and in the press. There have been no other letters of representation.

## **7.0 Environmental Impact Assessment**

- 7.1 The Town and Country Planning (Environmental Assessment) Regulations 2017
- 7.2 The development does not fall within Schedule 1 nor 2 and, as such, is not EIA development.

## **8.0 Duties**

- 8.1 Does the site affect the setting of a listed building?

Yes. Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or history interest which it possesses.

- 8.2 Is the site within a designated conservation area?

Yes. Section 72(1) of the Listed Buildings Act 1990 requires that special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area.

**8.3** Is the Development likely to have a significant effect upon a Natura 2000 designation? No

## **9.0 Development Plan Policies**

### **Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1)**

Policy S1	Presumption in favour of sustainable development
Policy S2	Sustainable development principles
Policy S27	Heritage Assets

## **10.0 Other material considerations**

### **National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2019)**

## **11.0 Policy weighting**

**11.1** Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. This means that the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1) 2014 and the Allerdale Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2020 policies have primacy.

## **12.0 Assessment**

**12.1** Policy S27 states that the historic environment including all heritage assets and their settings will be conserved and enhanced in a manner appropriate to their intrinsic historic value and significance, their importance to local character, distinctiveness and sense of place, and to other social, cultural, economic or environmental benefits/ values.

**12.2** Pear Tree House is Grade II listed. The listing reads as follows:

*List Entry: 114445*

*House. Dated and inscribed over entrance I.N. 1686 GOD FEARE with C20 alterations. Painted roughcast walls, enlarge projecting plinth stones, under graduated greenslate roof with painted roughcast chimney stacks. C20 door in chamfered surround under Tudor arch, with date and inscription, and hoodmould. C20 lead-paned casements windows in original chamfered surrounds, with stone mullions removed, under continuous drip mould on ground floor and under individual hoodmoulds above. Quatrefoil window over entrance. Side wall left has C20 door and sash windows with glazing bars in C19 painted stone surrounds. C20 extension to rear is not of interest.*

**12.3** The building is significant both architecturally and historically, in itself and within the setting.

**12.4** The purpose of the proposed works is to undertake repairs, as parts of the building are in poor condition and require replacement which where feasible seek to utilize more green insulation energy efficient measures. The applicant advises this includes consideration of:

- Respecting the buildings heritage and aesthetic
- Maximizing light to the property
- Maximizing thermal efficiency
- Providing a means of egress in the event of fire
- High quality craftsmanship replacements

**12.5** The key consideration relating to the merits of the proposal is whether the proposed works erode the significance of the building including any of its historic assets and features, as well as whether it safeguards its setting especially given the properties prominent corner location within the settlement fronting onto the open village green. The proposal relates to a range of alterations each of which can be individually examined:

- a) Windows. The existing windows on the property are a broad mixture of differing materials, designs and means of opening.
- The front multipane metallic windows casement windows on the front elevation are the most prominent to public view and influence the visual appearance of the front façade of the building onto the village green. The earlier approved consent 2/2006/0834 acknowledged these were 20<sup>th</sup> century replacements and proposed their replacement with 4 pane black powder coated aluminum windows within the original window openings (these details were not implemented). Thus it has been previously acknowledged that these are not the original historic windows to the property and whilst noting the comments of the parish, their removal and replacement as a modern details do not harm the historic fabric of the listed building. The proposal seeks to reinstate replacement timber materials in a double glazed multipane design. The design and means of opening seek to replicate that of the existing windows. The applicant has made reference to similar multiplane double glazed windows approved on two other listed buildings elsewhere in the village at Winder cottages under LBC/2019/0032 and LBC/2022/0014. Overall whilst acknowledging the perimeter frames are slightly wide, given the reinstatement of traditional materials, not impacting on an original features it is concluded the proposed works have a neutral impact and therefore may accepted.
  - Sliding sash gable windows. As these windows are traditional in their design, materials and means of opening officers had reservations on there replacement with double glazed units especially given their multipane design. The applicant contests these are not original but alternatively has amended the proposal to replace them with identical single pane timber sliding sash to match the existing i.e. a repair.
  - There are two very modern top hung timer windows on the rear flat roof extension which are to be replaced with timber double glazed multipane casement windows. As modern windows, replacing modern

windows, it is considered these windows, whilst visible to public view from the roadside are also not harmful with a similar neutral impact.

- The final windows relate to two small 4 pane windows on the rear elevation. It is also understood these were installed under the construction of the flat roof extension to the property and therefore albeit adopting a traditional design are also not original. The applicant seek to replace these with double glazed pane sling sash windows. This would not result in the enlargement of the existing window frames but would omit the vertical bar. As these are also not original windows and would retain a traditional window type on an elevation not prominent to public view, these details are also considered acceptable.
- b) Chimney repairs: An existing stack on the east end of the building is showing signs of cracking with lifting of the cement render. The render will be removed to assess the extent of any damage and repairs will be undertaken to reinstate the stack on a like for like basis (but with an alternative lime render mix). Officers consider these works to the chimney itself constitute repair works which subject to an identical replacement would not require listed building consent with the alternative more traditional lime render finish being welcomed.
- c) Replacement render finish/ painting. To external walls. The proposal also outlines the intent to replace the existing cement render external finish with an alternative lime render, but this may be more long term ambition. Officers consider the principle of replacing the existing modern cement render with a traditional lime render is welcomed and supported. The painting of the building (repeating its existing blue finish does not require listed building consent. Therefore it is considered that the proposal will not cause harm to the listed building or its setting.

## **Local Financial Considerations**

- 12.6** Having regard to S70 of the Town and Country Planning Act the proposal will have no local financial considerations.

## **13.0 Conclusions**

- 13.1** The proposal's extensive range of alterations, will cause minimal, if any, harm to the listed building significance or its setting. The proposal predominantly relate to existing modern, rather than traditional, aspects and features of the building. Overall officers consider these will either preserve or enhance the character of the building, which in turn will also conserve the appearance and setting of the Conservation Area. Therefore, it is considered that listed building consent should be granted.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

**Grant subject to conditions**

## Annex 1

### **CONDITIONS**

#### **Time Limit:**

1. **The works hereby consented shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.**

Reason: In order to comply with Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

#### **In Accordance:**

2. **The works hereby permitted shall be carried out solely in accordance with the following plans:**

**Location Plan**

**Dwg 032 PR WIN**

**Dwg 032 PRWIN**

**Dwg 032 PRDIN-DET**

**Dwg 02 rev 01 GF floor plan**

**Applicant's amended email and plans dated 18th August 2022 revising the proposed double glazed sliding sash multipane windows to the gable with alternative replacement single glazed timber sliding sash windows and details of the rear elevation sliding sash windows.**

Reason: In order to ensure that the works are carried out in complete accordance with the approved plans, and for then avoidance of doubt as to what works are consented, and any material and non-material alterations to the scheme are properly considered.



6.0m

Old Cobblers Shop

Sunset

ree  
ge

Cross Cottages

Cross

The Green

Pear Tree Ho  
Pear Tree Cott

East Terrace

The B

Orchard House

the Rowans

Manse Row

West Court

East C

Gilmour House

Mountain View

April Garth

Garth Cotts

65.4m