

Allerdale Borough Council

Planning Application LBC/2022/0017

Development Panel Report

Reference Number: LBC/2022/0017

Valid Date: 01/04/2022

Location: Christ Church
King Street
Maryport
CA15 6AT

Applicant: Joanne Spencer
Allerdale Borough Council

Proposal: Listed building consent to adapt the existing Christ Church to facilitate the relocation of Maryport Maritime Museum. Works include removal of the existing floor to form a new floor with services void and thermal upgrade, level access from the street, general external and internal repairs, adding security measures to the existing windows, new WCs and new mechanical and electrical systems throughout. Works also include the insertion of a contemporary timber pod to accommodate an environmentally controlled exhibition and store and additional floor space for the collection, this includes a new stair and lift.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT

1. Summary

<u>Issue</u>	<u>Conclusion</u>
Design and Heritage Assets	The proposal will lead to the effective re-use of the building with the associated internal and external works restoring and preserving the historic features of the building. The internal pod and mezzanine floor have been designed sympathetically to reduce any impact on the internal fabric. Therefore the proposal is considered acceptable, seeking to enhance and conserve both the Listed Building and the

	setting and character of the Conservation Area.
--	---

2. Proposal

- 2.1. The proposed development seeks alterations to the Grade II Listed Building to facilitate the relocation of Maryport Maritime Museum.
- 2.2. The use of this building is Class F.1 (f) for, or in connection with, public worship religious instruction under the new use class order 2020. The use as a museum falls within the same use under Class F.1 (c) as a museum. Therefore the proposed use does not require separate planning consent. This application only considers the internal and external alteration of this heritage asset to facilitate the museum.
- 2.3. The external works will constitute extensive repair of damaged fabric including the replacement of goods, the partial replacement and repair of roofs and repairs to the windows. A replacement clock will be introduced into the west façade.
- 2.4. The works will include (but is not limited to) the removal of inappropriate interventions such as cementitious mortars and pointing to joints and replacement with a suitable lime-based mortar mix, reinstatement of replicated terracotta ridge tiles, and replacement downpipes with cast iron rainwater goods.
- 2.5. External lighting and a sign are also proposed for the south elevation of the Church.
- 2.6. Internal fabric repairs of ceilings and the redecoration of walls and ceilings are planned. A new floor will also be laid which will involve the current floor being lifted and replaced.
- 2.7. The principal change to the Church is the introduction of a new build timber pod and mezzanine that will sit centrally within the church space, acting as additional floor area and exhibition space for the collection. A lift will be inserted central to the mezzanine to provide disabled access. The internal layout of the Church will also be reconfigured to allow for a café, shop and reception area, as well as additional education space and visitor toilets.
- 2.8. Additions to the windows will also be made internally to provide added security. These changes include the introduction of wooden shutters to openings on the west elevation. For windows on the north and east elevations, circular stainless steel security bars will be installed within the mullions.
- 2.9. The entrance to the church will be modified to be made fully accessible, by lowering the current threshold level to the street and adaption of the doors accordingly.
- 2.10. The Plans for consideration are:-

9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(00) 001 Site Location Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(00) 002 Site Block Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 003 Proposed South Elevation
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 001 Proposed Elevations – A & B
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 004 Proposed Elevation B - East
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 005 Proposed Elevation C – North
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 002 Proposed Elevations – C & D
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 006 Proposed Elevation D - West
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(06) 002 Proposed Section
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(06) 001 Proposed Section
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 010-B Proposed Ground Floor Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-(43) 001-A Ground Floor Finishes Plan amendment
received 5 May 2022
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 012 Proposed Ground Floor Reflective Ceiling Plan
9243-BA-XX-MZ-DR-A-(04) 013-A Mezzanine Reflective Ceiling Plan
9243-BA-XX-01-DR-A-(43) 002 Mezzanine Floor Finishes
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 001 Window Type 1a - Details
924BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 002 Window Type 1b - Details
9243-BA-XX-XA-(31) 003 Window Type 2 - Details
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 005 Proposed Ground Floor Plan-Window Type 4
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 004 Window Type 3 – Details
9243-XX-00-DR-A-(32) 101 Typical Security Door Details
9243-BA-EX-GF-DR-A-(24) 001 Threshold Adaption
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(20) 001 Ground Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-01-DR-A-(20) 002 First Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-02-DR-A-(20) 003 Second Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-RP-DR-A-(20) 004 Roof Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(01) 007 Reflected Ceiling Plan – Internal Fabric Repairs
9243-BA-EX-GF-DR-A-(34) 001 Balustrade Detail
9243-BA-XX-MZ-DR-A(04) 011-A Mezzanine
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 101 Security Plan
104495-MMD-S-D0-XX-0004 Rev P2 Mezzanine Steel Work Plan
104495-MMD-S-DR-00-XX-0005 Rev P2 Mezzanine Steelwork Sections
9243-BA-X
104495-MMD-00-DR-M-70002 Combined Services Mechanical & Public Health
Pipework Layout Ground Floor
104495-MMD-CC-00-DR-E-68001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Combined
Access Security & Fire Alarm Layout Ground Floor
4495-MMD-CC-00-DR-E-66001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Containment Layout
Ground Floor
104495-MMD-CC-DR-E-62001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Small Power & Data
Ground Floor
104495_MMD-CC-DR-M-70001 Rev P01 Mechanical Services Combined
Ventilation Heating & Colling and Domestic Water Schematic Sheet 01 of 01
104495-MMD-CC-M0-D-56001 Mechanical Services Pipework Layout Mezzanine
104495-MMD—M-57001 Rev P01 Mechanical Services Ventilation Services
Ground Floor
104495_MMD-CC-00-D-63001 Electrical Services General & Emergency Lighting
Layout Ground Floor

104495-MMD-S-00-XX-0002 Rev P2 Foundation General Arrangements and Details
104495-MMD-S-DR-00-XX-0003 Rev P2 Ground Floor General Arrangement and Details
100104495-MMD-XX-RP-MEP-0001 Rev P01 MEP Stage 3 Report
101104495 –MMD-XX-RP—0002 / P01 MMF110 Designers' Hazard Elimination and Management Record
104495-MMD-S-DR-XX-XX-0001 Rev P1 General Notes
Heritage Assessment March 2022
Design and Access Statement March 2022
9243-BA-XX-XX-SC-A-(09) Fabric Repairs Schedule March 2022
Restoration Specification March 2022
Appendix 5 Fabric Condition Inspection Report October 2021
Vertigo Product Guide – Lighting Received 5 May 2022
Vertigo W3x Installation Instructions – Lighting received 5 May 2022

The particulars are available to view via the following link:-

<https://allerdalebc.force.com/pr/s/planning-application/a3X3X00000B9F3jUAF/lbc20220017>

Site

- 2.11. The application site is located at the harbour edge. It is orientated on a north-east, south-east axis with the primary entrance off King Street.
- 2.12. The former Church has tall lancet windows and a high gabled roof in a Gothic style. It lies on the corner of King Street and North Quay in a pre-dominantly residential area. The site is served by on-street parking with parking available at the harbour side to the southwest. It lies within Maryport Conservation Area.
- 2.13. In 2021 Christ Church, of 1872, was listed at Grade II for the following principal reasons:

Architectural interest:

Constructed in good quality local materials, it is well-composed with an apsidal east and prominent west tower with broach spire; * a simple interior that retains structural detail including the collar-tie-truss roof structure, arcade and shafted windows; * it is carefully massed to make the most of its harbour side location which it dominates, and where it forms a striking and seamark.

Historic interest

For its close association with the national figure L S Lowry, in whose work for the church features prominently.

Group value

It benefits from a spatial group value with numerous listed buildings on North and South Quay including quayside offices and other harbour buildings.

3. Relevant Planning History

- 3.1. FUL/2019/0199 Change of use of Christ Church into Wedding Venue/Night Club – Refused.
- 3.2. FUL/2021/0309 Change of use from a Museum to a composite use involving an art gallery, exhibition space and an artist in residence flat and associated internal and external alterations, Maritime Museum, 1 Senhouse Street Maryport – Granted.

4. Representations

Maryport Town Council

- 4.1. No objection.

Historic England

- 4.2. Historic England provides advice when our engagement can add most value. In this case we are not offering advice.

County Archaeology

- 4.3. Christ Church is listed grade II and was designed by Charles Eaglesfield in the Early English style in 1872. Whilst the development aims to minimise the impact of the historic fabric of the Church through sympathetic design, it does propose an internal mezzanine floor and timber pod which will subdivide the currently open nave and chapel. The heritage statement determines that this impact will result in a less than substantial harm to the significance of the designated asset and so there is a planning balance to consider between the harm to the asset and the public benefits that will provided by the scheme.
- 4.4. In the event that it is considered the harm is outweighed by the public benefits of the proposed development and planning granted, I recommend that the church is recorded prior to conversion.
- 4.5. The application has been advertised by press advert, site notice and neighbour letter. No third-party representation have been received to date.

5. Environmental Impact Assessment

- 5.1. Under the Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) Regulations 2017, the development does not fall within Schedule 1 nor 2 and, as such, is not EIA development.

6. Duties

- 6.1. Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that the Local Planning Authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 6.2. Section 72(1) of the Listed Buildings Act 1990 states that, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

7. Development Plan Policies

7.1. Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1)

Policy S1 Presumption in Favour of Development
Policy S2 Sustainable Development
Policy S3 Spatial Strategy and Growth
Policy S27 Heritage Assets
Policy DM15 Extensions and Alterations to Existing Buildings and Properties

7.2. Allerdale Local Plan (Part 2)

Policy SA2 Settlement Boundaries

8. Other material considerations

8.1. National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2021)

9. Policy weighting

- 9.1. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. This means that the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1) 2014 and the Allerdale Borough Local Plan (Part 2) 2020 policies have primacy.

10. Assessment:

Principle of development

- 10.1. The use of the building for the Maritime Museum does not require planning permission. Therefore, the current application only seeks consent for the internal and external alterations of the Grade II Listed Building to facilitate this.
- 10.2. Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan seeks to safeguard, conserve and enhance heritage assets in safeguarding their significance and historic value. Policy DM15 seeks a high standard of design for proposals that involve the alteration and/or extension of existing buildings.
- 10.3. Section 72(1) of the Listed Buildings Act 1990 states that, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.
- 10.4. Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that the Local Planning Authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 10.5. The National Planning Policy Framework details when determining application for heritage assets local planning authorities should take account of:
 - a) The desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
 - b) The positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and
 - c) The desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.
- 10.6. The Council therefore has a duty to have a special regard on developments which may affect the character or setting of a conservation area or listed building.
- 10.7. Christ Church was designed by Charles Eaglesfield in the Early English Gothic style and dates to 1872. It retains its original external architectural features of note including the round apse and unusual portholes in the tower. The building is a prominent landmark from a number of sensitive points within and beyond the conservation area including Shipping Brow, the Harbour, South and North Quays, Brow Street and King Street.
- 10.8. The Council acknowledge that the building has stood vacant for a number of years and therefore any sympathetic scheme that secures the long-term survival of the Church is supported.
- 10.9. It is very original, retaining its single glazed lancet windows and other features synonymous with EE Gothic style architecture that was revived in ecclesiastical buildings of the nineteenth century. It is a landmark whose appearance and setting has changed little since it was built. It was and still is a beacon that sits at

the head of the harbour and provides highlights the older area of the town clustered around the water's edge. This is as true for visitors and those returning from the sea as it is from the land.

Exterior

- 10.10. Officers consider the proposed external works will result in negligible change to the material appearance of the church, as they will only result in a small level of visual alteration/change to the building, having minimal direct impacts on the fabric and use. All works proposed are for like-for-like replacement or sympathetic repair and will not result in any visual alterations, contributing to conserving and enhancing the building and the long-term conservation of the building.
- 10.11. The external works will introduce a sign and external lighting to the building. The design for the proposed lighting will use narrow beam lights/up lighting, which are commonly used on historic buildings. The signage proposed for the entrance is minimal in design and scale and will sit flush to the south elevation of the church. The introduction of these features will have minimal impact on the character of the listed building or the conservation area.

Interior

- 10.12. The existing flooring of the church will be retained and reused where possible, and general repair and redecoration of the walls and ceilings. These alterations will offer a like for like replacement approach to the walls and ceilings and will preserve the internal historic fabric of the building.
- 10.13. The most prominent internal change to the interior of the church is the introduction of the timber pod and mezzanine floor. This intervention is not fixed to the historic fabric and sits away from the wall to allow reading of the full space, minimising the impact on the historic fabric and enhancing potential for reversibility.
- 10.14. The internal space is currently read as a single void and officers acknowledge that the proposal will section this space up, increasing the overall solid to void ratio. However, it is recognised that to effectively re-use Christ Church for uses other than worship, alterations to the internal space of the church will inevitably involve subdivision of the nave and chancel.
- 10.15. The materials that are proposed for example wood and glass, are traditional and in keeping with those that already exist in the church. The modern design of the pod and floor will use these materials to create an intervention that provides visual contrast with the historic features of the church.
- 10.16. Given the proposed use of the building security measures need to be introduced. The addition of internal security bars and internal timber shutters are considered acceptable and officers consider the design chosen will have minimal impact on the internal fabric of the building.

Public Benefits

- 10.17. In considering the public benefits of the proposal the historic value of Christ Church as a community space contributes to its overall heritage significance and bringing the building back into active public use will ensure that this value is reinstated and maintained in the future.
- 10.18. The relocation of the museum into a bigger space also helps improve overall accessibility to Maryport's heritage resource and will improve engagement with the town's tangible and intangible history and heritage.
- 10.19. The development will result in moderate change to Christ Church as a heritage asset. Most of the change will occur internally, however potential harm to the buildings fabric and significance is mitigated by a minimum intervention approach. Overall, the harm is considered to be less than substantial, with the public benefits of the use both bringing tourism into the area and restoring to use this prominent building, close to the town centre; this outweighs the slight harm identified.
- 10.20. It is considered the proposal will not harm the setting of the Listed Buildings or the Conservation Area as a whole.

11. Conclusions

- 11.1. The proposal will lead to the effective re-use of the building with the associated internal and external works restoring and preserving the historic features of the building. The creation of the internal pod and mezzanine floor is considered to have been designed sympathetically to reduce any impact on the internal fabric. Therefore, the proposal is considered acceptable, seeking to enhance and conserve both the Listed Building and the setting and character of the Conservation Area.

12. RECOMMENDATION

GRANT

Annex 1

CONDITIONS

Time Limit:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: In order to comply with Section 18 (1) of the amended Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

In Accordance:

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out solely in accordance with the following plans:

9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(00) 001 Site Location Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(00) 002 Site Block Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 003 Proposed South Elevation
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 001 Proposed Elevations – A & B
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 004 Proposed Elevation B - East
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 005 Proposed Elevation C – North
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 002 Proposed Elevations – C & D
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(05) 006 Proposed Elevation D - West
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(06) 002 Proposed Section
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(06) 001 Proposed Section
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 010-B Proposed Ground Floor Plan
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-(43) 001-A Ground Floor Finishes Plan amendment received 5 May 2022
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 012 Proposed Ground Floor Reflective Ceiling Plan
9243-BA-XX-MZ-DR-A-(04) 013-A Mezzanine Reflective Ceiling Plan
9243-BA-XX-01-DR-A-(43) 002 Mezzanine Floor Finishes
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 001 Window Type 1a - Details
924BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 002 Window Type 1b - Details
9243-BA-XX-XA-(31) 003 Window Type 2 - Details
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 005 Proposed Ground Floor Plan-Window Type 4
9243-BA-XX-XX-DR-A-(31) 004 Window Type 3 – Details
9243-XX-00-DR-A-(32) 101 Typical Security Door Details
9243-BA-EX-GF-DR-A-(24) 001 Threshold Adaption
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(20) 001 Ground Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-01-DR-A-(20) 002 First Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-02-DR-A-(20) 003 Second Floor Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-RP-DR-A-(20) 004 Roof Demolition Plan
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(01) 007 Reflected Ceiling Plan – Internal Fabric Repairs
9243-BA-EX-GF-DR-A-(34) 001 Balustrade Detail

9243-BA-XX-MZ-DR-A(04) 011-A Mezzanine
9243-BA-XX-00-DR-A-(04) 101 Security Plan
104495-MMD-S-D0-XX-0004 Rev P2 Mezzanine Steel Work Plan
104495-MMD-S-DR-00-XX-0005 Rev P2 Mezzanine Steelwork Sections
9243-BA-X
104495-MMD-00-DR-M-70002 Combined Services Mechanical & Public Health Pipework Layout Ground Floor
104495-MMD-CC-oo-DR-E-68001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Combined Access Security & Fire Alarm Layout Ground Floor
4495-MMD-CC-00-DR-E-66001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Containment Layout Ground Floor
104495-MMD-CC-DR-E-62001 Rev P01 Electrical Services Small Power & Data Ground Floor
104495_MMD-CC-DR-M-70001 Rev P01 Mechanical Services Combined Ventilation Heating & Colling and Domestic Water Schematic Sheet 01 of 01
104495-MMD-CC-M0-D-56001 Mechanical Services Pipework Layout Mezzanine
104495-MMD—M-57001 Rev P01 Mechanical Services Ventilation Services Ground Floor
104495_MMD-CC-00-D-63001 Electrical Services General & Emergency Lighting Layout Ground Floor
104495-MMD-S-00-XX-0002 Rev P2 Foundation General Arrangements and Details
104495-MMD-S-DR-00-XX-0003 Rev P2 Ground Floor General Arrangement and Details
100104495-MMD-XX-RP-MEP-0001 Rev P01 MEP Stage 3 Report
101104495 –MMD-XX-RP—0002 / P01 MMF110 Designers' Hazard Elimination and Management Record
104495-MMD-S-DR-XX-XX-0001 Rev P1 General Notes
Heritage Assessment March 2022
Design and Access Statement March 2022
9243-BA-XX-XX-SC-A-(09) Fabric Repairs Schedule March 2022
Restoration Specification March 2022
Appendix 5 Fabric Condition Inspection Report October 2021
Vertigo Product Guide – Lighting Received 5 May 2022
Vertigo W3x Installation Instructions – Lighting received 5 May 2022

Reason: In order to ensure that the development is carried out in complete accordance with the approved plans and any material and non-material alterations to the scheme are properly considered.

2. **Prior to the carrying out of any conversion work the existing building affected by the proposed development shall be recorded in accordance with a Level 2 Survey as described by Historic England's document Understanding Historic Buildings A Guide to Good Recording Practice 2016. Within 2 months of the commencement of construction works a digital copy of the resultant level 2 Survey report shall be furnished to the Local Planning Authority.**

Reason: To ensure that a permanent record is made of the building of architectural and historical interest prior to its alteration as part of the proposed development, in compliance with the National Planning Policy Framework and Policy S27 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1), Adopted July 2014.