

Allerdale Borough Council

Planning Application LBC/2021/0022

Development Panel Report

Reference Number: LBC/2021/0022
Valid Date: 14/06/2021
Location: The Barn, Blencogo Farm, Blencogo, CA7 0BZ
Applicant: T Harrison
Proposal: Listed building consent for installation of integrated PV panels in roof

RECOMMENDATION

Refuse

1.0 Summary

<u>Issue</u>	<u>Conclusion</u>
Principle of Development	The principle of change of use and works to the roof has been established under FUL/2020/0153 and LBC/2020/0019.
Heritage	The barn is significant in terms of architecture and history as a curtilage listed building. The roof is also visible in the setting of the adjacent listed building. The integrated pv panels will be visible in the context of the surrounding natural slate tiles and result in harm to the appearance of the curtilage listed building.
Sustainability	The integrated pv panels would result in a renewable source of energy for the new dwelling and would not be irreversible. However, the conservation of heritage assets is also a key part of sustainable development.

2.0 Proposal

- 2.1 The proposal is for the installation of integrated PV panels on the roof of the barn. The integrated PV panels are designed as tiles which are flush to the roof.
- 2.2 The integrated PV panels would be located in a central block on the roof elevation that faces the road. The remaining area of roof would be natural slate.
- 2.3 The roof slates have already been removed in accordance with the implementation of FUL/2020/0153 which provides for the change of use of the barn to a dwelling.
- 2.4 The Plans and images for consideration are:-

TH/KT/21/01 Installation of PV Panels
GB-Sol PV Slate on cottage
PVslate_Datasheet_v4.5

3.0 Site

- 3.1 The proposal relates to a redundant barn to the north east of the main farmhouse at Blencogo Farm, which lies in the village of Blencogo. The detached barn fronts onto the highway and is constructed of stone. The barn has been subject to alteration, most notably to the rear. The wider farmyard appears to no longer be in use. The farmhouse is Grade II listed and this detached barn is considered to be curtilage listed.
- 3.2 Work is underway for the change of use of the barn to a dwelling and the slate roof has already been removed.
- .

4.0 Relevant Planning History

- 4.1 There have been several applications relating to the site:
- FUL/2020/0153 - Conversion of barn to dwelling - approved, 12th November 2020
 - LBC/2020/0019 Listed Building consent for change of use of barn to dwelling – approved January 2021.

5.0 Representations

Cumbria Highways and LLFA

- 5.1 No comments.

Historic England

5.2 No comments.

6.0 Duties

6.1 Section 16 of the Planning (LB & CA) Act 1990 requires that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

7.0 Development Plan Policies

Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1) 2014

7.1 The following policies are considered to be relevant:-

S1 – Presumption in favour of sustainable development

S2 – Sustainable development principles

S27 – Heritage Assets

DM12- Sustainable construction

DM14 – Standards of Good Design

8.0 Other material considerations

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (2019)

HEAG173 Energy Efficiency and Historic Buildings

9.0 Policy weighting

9.1 Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that, if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the Planning Acts, the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. This means that the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1) 2014 and Allerdale Local Plan (Part 2) policies have primacy.

10.0 Assessment

Principle of development

- 10.1 The principle of the change of use to a dwelling, together with the replacement of the roof has already been established under recent planning and listed building consent applications. The approved scheme provides for rooflights on the north facing elevation, but the south facing roof is to be restored with natural slate. Therefore, works to the roof are acceptable in principle, but the nature of the materials is the subject of this application.

Heritage

- 10.2 Policy 27 states that the historic environment including all heritage assets and their settings will be conserved and enhanced in a manner appropriate to their intrinsic historic value and significance, their importance to local character, distinctiveness and sense of place, and to other social, cultural economic or environmental benefits/values.
- 10.3 The barn subject of the application is curtilage listed. The main farmhouse and adjoining barn at Blencogo Farm are Grade II listed buildings and these listed buildings lie to the immediate west of the subject barn. The proposal therefore has the potential to impact on the heritage value of the barn as an asset in its own right, as well as the potential to impact on the group setting of the farmstead's listed buildings.
- 10.4 The listing states:
- 'Farmhouse and adjoining barn. Early C19, barn incorporating earlier doorway inscribed T.I. & I.I. 1674. Painted incised stucco, with V-jointed quoins, on chamfered plinth; under graduated greenslate roof. Barn of painted rubble, with flush quoins, under graduated greenslate roof. 2 storeys, 3 bays with lower barn to right. Top-glazed door, under blind overlight, in pilastered doorcase with urns in relief on friezes, all under pediment. C20 casement windows in painted stone surrounds. Barn has C20 door in C17 chamfered surround under Tudor arch and hoodmould. C20 windows in C19 painted stone surrounds under slit vents'.*
- 10.5 The barn itself remains largely agrarian in appearance, particularly to the front where openings are minimal and the slate roof remains intact. The barn has been subject to more significant alterations to the rear, where openings are large, between brick built piers, with some infilled sections of breeze block. The barn aligns to the front with the listed farmhouse and adjoining barn and adds positively to their group value.
- 10.6 In terms of significance, the barn is architecturally and historically significant both of itself and in relation to the listed farmhouse and barn to the east.
- 10.7 Historic England have produced guidance on 'Energy Efficiency and Historic Buildings'. The guide doesn't remove the need to assess the significance of the building and any impact of solar panels or solar slates on the significance. The document states,

- 10.8 'The location of the panels and managing their visual impact is an important part of the design. All parts of the system that are visible should be considered carefully. **It is generally not considered sympathetic to a building's appearance to have a solar panel or other equipment fixed to its main elevations**; that is, the face or faces seen from the direction from which it is most commonly viewed. Buildings with main elevations aligned in the direction of optimal solar radiation may present special installation problems with regards to visual impact'.
- 10.9 Therefore, at the time of the previous applications, officers expressed concerns about the use of integrated PV panels on the front slope of the roof. These were removed from the scheme at that stage.
- 10.10 In terms of harm, integrated PV panels seem to have a glossier finish to a normal slate, whereas the slates to the barn, in combination with the slate roof to the listed building itself and its adjoining barn have a weathered, dull finish. In combination the rooves have an attractive weathered appearance that contributes to the significance of these heritage assets when viewed as a group. The introduction of an area of alternative material may introduce a patchwork aspect of the traditional and modern material which will be visible from a public roadside and will result in harm to the heritage assets.

Sustainability

- 10.11 Policy S1 of the Allerdale Local Plan (Part 1), Adopted July 2014 sets out the Council's positive approach to sustainable development and the aim to secure development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions in the area. Policy S2 sets out sustainable development principles. It clarifies that sustainable development includes the reduction of Allerdale's carbon footprint, promoting renewable energy, and ensuring that historic assets are enhanced and in all circumstances conserved. Policy DM12 outlines the types of sustainable construction measures including those that maximise energy efficiency and the incorporation of low carbon/renewable energy sources.
- 10.12 The reduction of carbon footprint resulting from the installation of integrated PV panels is a material consideration that must be weighed in the planning balance. The panels would have a limited life span so the alterations are not irreversible. However, it is noted that the conservation of historic assets is also a key part of sustainable development. The integrated PV panels would be on a principal elevation and it is considered other methods of renewable energy could be investigated which would have less impact on the heritage assets.
- 10.13. Given the substantial harm arising from the proposed development, officers under the provisions of the NPPF, do not consider there are any public benefits associated with these works which outweigh this harm.

11.0 Conclusions

11.1 The barn is significant in itself as a curtilage listed building. The integrated PV panels would be visible from the road and within the setting of the grade II listed farmhouse and barn. The integrated PV panels would be visible in contrast to the natural slate tiles on the remaining area of the roof, and would represent harm. Therefore it is considered that listed building consent should be refused.

RECOMMENDATION

Refusal

The Local planning authority consider the proposed use of modern integrated PV panels on the primary frontage of the curtilage listed building would have a substantial harmful impact on the historic significance, value and appearance of the curtilage listed barn and the wider group setting of the farmstead's Grade II listed farmhouse and barn. Therefore, the proposal is contrary to Policy S27 of the Local Plan (Part 1) and para's 195 and 196 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

